



कार्यालय मुख्य आयुक्त
Office of the Chief Commissioner
सीजीएसटी एवं केन्द्रीय उत्पाद शुल्क (जयपुर परिक्षेत्र), जयपुर
CGST & Central Excise (Jaipur Zone), Jaipur

F.No. GCCO/RTI/APP/50/2024-LEGAL

Dated .01.2024

To

Sh. Satyender Singh,
Steno-II, CGST Alwar,
A Block, Surya Nagar,
Alwar-301001

Sir,

Subject: - Online RTI application registration No. GSTJP/R/E/24/00003 dated 04.01.2024, filed by Sh. Satyendra Singh, CGST Office, A Block, Surya Nagar, Alwar, Pin : 335512 – reg.

Please refer to your RTI application Registration No. GSTJP/R/E/24/00003 dated 04.01.2024 for providing information under RTI Act, 2005.

With reference to the information sought please find enclosed total 8 pages as detailed below:-

1. Zone of Consideration (2 pages)
2. Minutes of Meeting (6 pages)

If you are not satisfied with above reply, you may prefer an appeal against the reply within 30 days of receipt of this reply to The Appellate Authority and Additional Commissioner, Office of the Chief Commissioner, CGST & Central Excise (JZ) Jaipur, New Central Revenue Building, Statue Circle, C-Scheme, Jaipur-302005. _

Encl: As Above.

Yours sincerely,

Signed by

Anupama Saksena

Date: 30-01-2024 16:38:40

(Anupama Saksena)

CPIO & Assistant Commissioner

Copy to:-

1. Superintendent (Computer), CGST & Central Excise, Jaipur to upload on Zonal website.

OFFICE OF THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER, CGST & CENTRAL EXCISE, JAIPUR ZONE, JAIPUR
(CADRE CONTROL UNIT)

CONSIDERATION LIST OF ELIGIBLE STENOGRAPHERS GRADE-II FOR REGULAR PROMOTION TO THE GRADE OF STENOGRAPHER GRADE-I GROUP 'B' (NON-GAZETTED) IN THE PAY BAND/SCALE OF RS. 9300-34800 (PB-2) WITH CORRESPONDING GRADE PAY OF RS. 4200 (REVISED AS LEVEL-6 IN PAY MATRIX RS. 35400-112400) FOR FILLING UP 8 REGULAR VACANCIES (7 UR + 1 SC) INCLUDING ONE RESERVED FOR PwBD (LOCOMOTOR DISABILITY) FOR THE PANEL YEAR 2024 (01.01.2024 TO 31.12.2024)

BREAK UP OF TOTAL VACANCIES : 8 VACANCIES (7 UR + 1 SC)

ELIGIBILITY : 10 YEARS REGULAR SERVICE AS STENOGRAPHER GRADE-II AS ON 01.01.2024

METHOD OF PROMOTION : SELECTION METHOD (Benchmark 'Good')

D.P.C. HELD ON : 26.12.2023

Sl. No.	Name of Stenographer Grade-II (S/Shri)	Category	Service Particulars		Recommendations of the DPC for promotion	Remarks
			Date of Birth	Date of joining as Stenographer Grade-II		
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	Dharm Raj Meena	ST	22.07.86	20.06.13	'FIT'	
2	Mahendar Kumar	OBC	06.06.89	10.07.13	'FIT'	
3	Mahesh Darji	OBC	06.11.91	26.08.13	'FIT'	
4	Dharam Pal	OBC	10.07.88	31.10.13	'FIT'	
5	Susheel Kumar	Gen	18.06.90	12.07.13	'FIT'	
6	Amit Kumar Jasoriya	Gen	01.12.89	18.06.13	'FIT'	

Gai

2/11

Babbar

Sl. No.	Name of Stenographer Grade-II (S/Shri)	Category	Service Particulars		Recommendations of the DPC for promotion	Remarks
			Date of Birth	Date of joining as Stenographer Grade-II		
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
7	Bhupendra Mahla	OBC	13.07.88	16.08.13	Not considered for want of UR vacancy.	
8	Jagmeet Singh	Gen	05.03.93	12.07.13	— do —	
9	Tulsiram	OBC	22.07.88	08.08.13	— do —	

Babneet Tuli
26/12/23
(BABNEET TULI)
ADDITIONAL COMMISSIONER
CGST & CENTRAL EXCISE (JZ), JAIPUR
MEMBER

Chetan Kumar Jain
26/12/23
(CHETAN KUMAR JAIN)
PRINCIPAL COMMISSIONER
CGST & CENTRAL EXCISE COMMISSIONERATE, JAIPUR
CHAIRMAN

Sunita Verma
26/12/23
(SUNITA VERMA)
JOINT COMMISSIONER
APPEALS COMMISSIONERATE, JAIPUR
MEMBER

**OFFICE OF THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER,
CGST & CENTRAL EXCISE (JZ): JAIPUR**

MINUTES OF THE DPC HELD ON 26.12.2023 FOR REGULAR PROMOTION TO THE GRADE OF STENOGRAPHER GRADE-I, GROUP 'B' (NON-GAZETTED) IN THE PAY SCALE / BAND OF RS. 9300-34800 WITH CORRESPONDING GRADE PAY OF Rs. 4200 IN PB-2 (REVISED AS LEVEL – 6 IN THE PAY BAND / SCALE OF Rs. 35400-112400) FROM AMONGST STENOGRAPHER GRADE-II, GROUP 'C' IN THE PAY SCALE/BAND OF (RS. 5200-20200 GRADE PAY RS. 2400/- PB-1) (REVISED AS LEVEL-4 IN THE PAY MATRIX OF RS. 25500-81100) FOR FILLING UP 8 EXISTING VACANCIES (7 UR + 1 SC) INCLUDING ONE RESERVED FOR PwBD (LOCOMOTOR DISABILITY) FOR THE PANEL YEAR 2024 (01.01.2024 TO 31.12.2024).

Present:

(S/SHRI/MS)

- | | | | |
|----|--|-------|----------|
| 1. | CHETAN KUMAR JAIN,
PRINCIPAL COMMISSIONER,
CGST & C. EX. COMMISSIONERATE,
JAIPUR | ----- | CHAIRMAN |
| 2. | BABNEET TULI
ADDITIONAL COMMISSIONER
O/o THE CHIEF COMMISSIONER
CGST & CE (JZ) JAIPUR | ----- | MEMBER |
| 3. | SUNITA VERMA,
JOINT COMMISSIONER,
APPEALS COMMISSIONERATE,
JAIPUR | ----- | MEMBER |

This DPC has been informed vide note that an advance select panel is to be prepared for regular promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) for the panel/vacancy year 2024 (01.01.2024 to 31.12.2024) for filling up 8 existing vacancies (7 UR + 1 SC) including one reserved for PwBD (Locomotor Disability) from amongst Stenographer Grade-II, Group 'C'.

2. As per Post Based Roster, the category-wise position in the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) in promotion quota for the panel/vacancy year 2024, is as under -

Category	Posts Earmarked	Working	(-) Shortfall / (+) Excess
Unreserved	10	3	(-) 7
SC	1	0	(-) 1
ST	0	0	0
Total	11	3	(-) 8

Shri

Jain

Babneet

In view of the above, out of 8 vacancies in the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) in promotion quota, 7 vacancies are unreserved and one vacancy is reserved for the SC category.

3. As per Recruitment Rules forwarded by the Ministry under letter F.No. A.12018/13/2012.AD.III.B dated 19.10.2015, the post of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) is to be filled up by **selection method** and Stenographer Grade-II with 10 years regular service as on 01.01.2024 are eligible for consideration for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted). In terms of para 3.4 of DOPT's O.M. No.35034/7/97-Estt.(D) dated 08.02.2002, the bench mark for promotion in **selection posts** below the pre-revised pay scale of Rs. 12000-16500 (Revised as Rs. 15600-39100 + Grade Pay of Rs. 7600 and further revised as Level-12 in Pay Matrix Rs. 78800-209200), is '**Good**' and the DPC shall grade the officer as 'Fit' or 'Unfit' only w.r.t. the bench mark of 'Good' only. Those who are graded as 'Fit' shall be included in the select panel prepared by the DPC in order of their inter-seniority in the feeder grade.

4. In terms of para 5(ii) of DOPT's said O.M. No. 22011/4/2013-Estt. (D) dated 08.05.2017, the crucial date of eligibility is 1st January, 2024 for the Vacancy year 2024.

5.1 As per the instructions contained in the DOPT's O.M. No.22011/2/2002-Estt(D) dated 06.01.2006 regarding size of zone of consideration for promotion by 'Selection' method, the normal zone of consideration for filling up 8 regular vacancies is 20. However, only 9 eligible Stenographer Grade-II who are completing 10 years of regular service in the grade of Stenographer Grade-II as on 01.01.2024 are available in the normal zone as well as extended zone of consideration. Hence, 9 Stenographer Grade-II has been taken in to consideration for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I for the vacancy year 2024.

5.2 Shri Satyendra Singh, Stenographer Grade-II has not been taken in to consideration for regular promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) for filling up the vacancies for the vacancy year 2024 due to the reasons as mentioned in the para 5.2.1 to 5.2.4 of self contained note.

6. As per DoPT's said O.M. dated 08.05.2017, the APARs for five years i.e. **2021-2022, 2020-2021, 2019-2020, 2018-19 and 2017-2018**, have been taken into consideration for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I against the vacancies for the vacancy year 2024.

7.1 The DoPT vide O.M No. 36012/16/2019-Estt. (Res.) dated 12.04.2022 has issued instructions regarding Reservation in promotions. The O.M. contains the procedure to be followed prior to effecting reservation in **the matter of promotions** by all departments of the Central Government in pursuance of judgement dated 28.01.2022 of the **Hon'ble Supreme Court** of India in the case of **Jarnail Singh** and Ors. V Lachhmi Narain Gupta and Ors. The para 2 of the said O.M. dated 12.04.2022 is reproduced as under:

"2 In the judgement dated 28.01.2022, the Supreme Court has set out the conditions that are to be satisfied by the Government for the purpose of implementing the policy of reservations in promotions. These conditions are:

- (i) Collection of quantifiable data regarding inadequacy of representation of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes;*
- (ii) Application of this data to each cadre separately; and*
- (iii) If a roster exists, the unit for operation of the roster would be the cadre for which the quantifiable data would have to be collected and applied in regard to the filling up of the vacancies in the roster.*

This judgement currently holds the field.

Gain

11/11

9

1. All the Ministries/Departments are required to ensure that the above conditions are complied with before implementing the policy of reservation in promotions and carrying out any promotions based thereon.
2. For this purpose, all Ministries/Departments are also required to ensure the following:
 - a. In terms of DoPT OM No. 43011/153/2010-Estt (res.) dated 04.01.2013, the Liaison Officer shall ensure that the reservation rosters are strictly maintained as per the instructions/guidelines, laid down in DoPT OM No. 36012/2/96-Estt (Res.), dated 02.07.1997.
 - b. In order to ensure maintenance of efficiency of administration, the DPC shall carefully assess the suitability of the officers, being considered for promotion.
 - c. The appointing authority shall issue the appointment/promotion orders only after satisfying itself that the conditions mentioned in paragraph 2 and sub para (a) & (b) of this paragraph have been fully complied with.
3. Since the **Jarnail Singh** batch of cases is pending in the Supreme Court of India, any promotion order shall be subject to further orders that may be passed by the Supreme Court in the said batch of cases.
4. All Ministries/Departments are requested to urgently bring these instructions to the notice of all their attached/ subordinate offices as also the Public Sector Undertakings and Statutory Bodies etc. for adherence and strict compliance."

7.2 The reservation rosters for promotions have been maintained as per the instructions/guidelines as laid down in DoPT OM No. 36012/2/96-Estt. (Res.), dated 02.07.1997. The C&AG vide Circular No. 9/NGE//98 No. 108/NGE. (App.)3/97, dated 23.01.1998 had issued clarification of doubts in DoPT's O.M. No. 36012/2/96-Estt. (RES.), dated 02.07.1997 in consultation with the DoPT. As per doubt No. 5 of the said circular dated 23.01.1998, "**own merit**" concept is not applicable in promotions.

In view of the aforesaid instructions, if any reserved category candidate is selected for promotion to the grade of Stenographer, Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted), he/she will be adjusted against the reservation. In case, there is no reserved vacancy and reserved category candidate is selected on the basis of his/her seniority, he/she will, however, get promotion but will be adjusted in future when relevant reserved category vacancy will arise in the grade of Stenographer, Grade-I.

8.1 The Ministry vide letter F.No. A-10A60/42/2021-Ad.II.B dated 17.06.2022 has forwarded DoPT's OM dated 17.05.2022 issued under F.No. 36012/1/2020-Estt.(Res.II) regarding reservation in promotion to Persons with Benchmark Disabilities (PwBDs). As per the said OM dated 17.05.2022, four percent of vacancies for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I shall be reserved for PwBDs.

8.2 A roster for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I for providing reservation to the PwBDs categories, has been prepared in terms of the DoPT's aforesaid O.M. dated 17.05.2022. As per the roster of Stenographer Grade-I, one vacancy out of 8 vacancies of Stenographer Grade-I, is reserved for the locomotor disability (PwBDs) category.

8.3 No eligible Stenographer Grade-II of the PwBDs of category of locomotor disability is available for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I for filling up one vacancy reserved for PwBD (Locomotor Disability), out of 8 vacancies for the vacancy year 2024. Hence, one post of Stenographer Grade-I has been kept vacant for the PwBDs category.

Bobach

Gai

2/11/22

9. The DoP&T vide O.M. No. 22011/5/86-Estt. (D), dated 10.04.1989 has issued guidelines for DPC.

- In terms of para 6.2.1 (a) of the DPC guidelines, the DPC should consider CRs for equal number of years in respect of all officers consideration for promotion subject to (c) below.

- In terms of para 6.2.1 (b) of the DPC guidelines, the DPC should assess the suitability of the employees for promotion on the basis of their service record and when particular reference to the CRs for the five preceding years irrespective of the qualifying service prescribed in the service/Recruitment Rules.

- In terms of para 6.2.1 (c) of the DPC guidelines, where one or more CRs have not been written for any reason during the relevant period, the DPC should consider the CRs of the years preceding the period in question and if in any case even these are not available, DPC should take the CRs of the lower grade into account to complete the number of CRs required to be considered as per (b) above. **If this is also not possible, all the available CRs should be taken into account.**

- In terms of para 6.2.1 (e) of the DPC guidelines, the DPC should not be guided merely by the overall grading, if any, that may be recorded in the CRs but should make its own assessment on the basis of the entries in the CRs, because it has been noticed that sometimes the overall grading in CR may be inconsistent with the grading under various parameters or attributes.

- As per para 6.4.1 of the DPC guidelines regarding preparation of year wise panels by DPC where they have not met for a number of years, where for reasons beyond control, the DPC could not be held in a year (s), even though the vacancies arose during that year (or years), the first DPC that meets thereafter should follow the following procedures:-

- (i) Determine the actual number of regular vacancies that arose in each of the previous year (s) immediately preceding and the actual number of regular vacancies proposed to be filled in the current year separately.
- (ii) Consider in respect of each of the years those officers only who would be within the field of choice with reference to the vacancies of each year starting with the earliest year onwards.
- (iii) Prepare a 'Select List' by placing the select list of the earlier year above the one for the next year and so on.

- In terms of para 6.4.3 of the DPC guidelines regarding service records to be scrutinized while preparing year wise panel, for the purpose of evaluation, the merit of the officers while preparing year wise panels, the scrutiny of the records of service of the officers should be limited to the records that would have been available had the DPC met at the appropriate time.

- **In terms of para 6.4.4 of the DPC guidelines regarding promotion, while promotion will be made in the order of the consolidated select list, such promotions will have only prospective effect even in cases where the vacancies relate to earlier year(s).**

- **As per para 17.10 of the DPC guidelines regarding date from which promotion are to be treated as regular, the general principle is that, promotion of officers included in the panel would be regular from the date of validity of the panel or the date of their actual promotion, whichever is later.**

10. As per Recruitment Rules forwarded by the Ministry under letter F.No. A.12018/13/2012.AD.III.B dated 19.10.2015, the post of Stenographer Grade-I,

Agar

AD

م

Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) is to be filled up by **selection method**. In terms of para 3.4 of DOPT's O.M. No.35034/7/97-Estt. (D), dated 08.02.2002, the bench mark for promotion in selection posts below the pre-revised pay scale of Rs. 12000-16500 (Revised as Level-12 in Pay Matrix Rs. 78800-209200), is '**Good**' and the DPC should grade the officer as 'Fit' or 'Unfit' only w.r.t. the bench mark of '**Good**' only. Those who are graded as 'Fit' are included in the select panel prepared by the DPC in order of their inter-se-seniority in the feeder grade. As per the criterion adopted by the DPC for making selection, **the candidates whose grading in all 5 ACRs are at least 'Good' without any adverse remarks, have been graded as 'Fit'**. The candidates whose grading are less than 'Good' in these 5 ACRs or with any adverse remarks in any ACR(s), have been graded as '**Unfit**' for regular promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, "Group B" (Non-Gazetted).

11. On the basis of the said criteria for making selection for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, "Group B" (Non-Gazetted), the recommendations of this DPC for regular promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, "Group B" (Non-Gazetted) for filling up 8 regular vacancies (**7 UR + 1 SC**) including one vacancy reserved for PwBDs (locomotor disability) for the vacancy year 2024, are as under :-

S. No	Name of Stenographer Grade-II S/Shri	Category	Date of Birth	Recommendations of the DPC
1.	Dharm Raj Meena	ST	22.07.86	Fit
2.	Mahendar Kumar	OBC	06.06.89	Fit
3.	Mahesh Darji	OBC	06.11.91	Fit
4.	Dharam Pal	OBC	10.07.88	Fit
5.	Susheel Kumar	Gen	18.06.90	Fit
6.	Amit Kumar Jasoriya	Gen	01.12.89	Fit
7.	Bhupendra Mahla	OBC	13.07.88	Not considered for want of UR category vacancy.
8.	Jagmeet Singh	Gen	05.03.93	Not considered for want of UR category vacancy.
9.	Tulsiram	OBC	22.07.88	Not considered for want of UR category vacancy.

On the basis of the above recommendations, the following **select panel** is drawn for regular promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) for filling up **6 UR regular vacancies**, out of **8 regular vacancies (7 UR + 1 SC)** including one vacancy reserved for the PwBD category:-

S. No	Name of Inspectors (S/Shri)	Category	Date of Birth
1.	Dharm Raj Meena	ST	22.07.86
2.	Mahendar Kumar	OBC	06.06.89
3.	Mahesh Darji	OBC	06.11.91
4.	Dharam Pal	OBC	10.07.88
5.	Susheel Kumar	Gen	18.06.90
6.	Amit Kumar Jasoriya	Gen	01.12.89

No SC category Stenographer Grade-II has been selected for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) against one regular vacancy reserved for the SC category, therefore, the said one regular vacancy reserved for the SC category in the grade of Stenographer Grade-I, Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted) is kept vacant in terms of the DOPT's O.M. F.No.89011/7/90-Estt.B dated 08.02.1991 and CBEC's letter F. No. A-

R. S. Meena

G. S. Meena

M. S. Meena

14011/3/92-Ad.III.A dated 18.05.1993 as discussed/mentioned in the self contained note.

No ST category vacancy is available for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted). However, 1 ST category Stenographer Grade-II has been selected for promotion to the grade of Stenographer Grade-I Group 'B' (Non-Gazetted). Therefore, adjustment of this 1 excess ST category post will be made in future when vacancy will arise in the ST category as per point 5 (c) of clarifications regarding post based reservation rosters issued by C. & A.G., in consultation with the DOPT vide Circular No. 9/NGE/98 NO. 108/NGE (App.)/3-97 dated 23.01.1998.

Jain
26/12/23

(CHETAN KUMAR JAIN)
PRINCIPAL COMMISSIONER
CGST & CE COMMISSIONERATE,
JAIPUR
CHAIRMAN

Babneet

(BABNEET TULI)
ADDITIONAL COMMISSIONER
CGST & CE(JZ) JAIPUR,
MEMBER

Sunita
26/12/23

(SUNITA VERMA)
JOINT COMMISSIONER
APPEALS COMMISSIONERATE,
JAIPUR
MEMBER

RTI REQUEST DETAILS (आरटीआई अनुरोध विवरण)

Registration Number (पंजीकरण संख्या) :	GSTJP/R/E/24/00003	Date of Receipt (प्राप्ति की तारीख) :	04/01/2024
Type of Receipt (रसीद का प्रकार) :	Online Receipt	Language of Request (अनुरोध की भाषा) :	English
Name (नाम) :	Satyendra Singh	Gender (लिंग) :	Male
Address (पता) :	CGST Commissionerate,, Surya Nagar, Alwar, Alwar, Pin:335512		
State (राज्य) :	Rajasthan	Country (देश) :	India
Phone Number (फोन नंबर) :	+91-8619598002	Mobile Number (मोबाईल नंबर) :	+91-8619598002
Email-ID (ईमेल-आईडी) :	bikarathore90@gmail.com		
Status (स्थिति)(Rural/Urban) :	Urban	Education Status :	Graduate
Is Requester Below Poverty Line ? (क्या आवेदक गरीबी रेखा से नीचे का है?) :	No	Citizenship Status (नागरिकता) :	Indian
Amount Paid (राशि का भुगतान) :	10) (original recipient)	Mode of Payment (भुगतान का प्रकार) :	Payment Gateway
Does it concern the life or Liberty of a Person? (क्या यह किसी व्यक्ति के जीवन अथवा स्वतंत्रता से संबंधित है?) :	No(Normal)	Request Pertains to (अनुरोध निम्नलिखित संबंधित है) :	Anupama Saksena, CCO, JZ
Information Sought (जानकारी मांगी) :	Please refer to EO No. CCU -02 /2024 dated 01.01.2024 issued by the Additional Commissioner, CCU, CGST Jaipur Zone vide which Steno-II are promoted to the grade of Steno-I. Please provide me the Zone of Consideration for aforesaid DPC. Also provide the minutes of meeting of the same.		
<input type="button" value="Print"/> <input type="button" value="Save"/> <input type="button" value="Close"/>			